

only be appropriate to the character of Hamlet or Dante, or suggestive of a certain external phenomenon such as the wind, or the fire, or the water, but it must also be interesting as music." Newman, 1910, 112. See also Tovey, 1937, IV, 1, 155. However, Newman does go on to argue against the "fallacy" that program music should be just as satisfying to the listener who is unaware of the program as to the initiated. *Ibid.*, 147–57.

14. Liszt, quoted in Scruton, 1980, 15: 284. Tovey, in his discussion of Berlioz, points out how inadequate these subordinations could sometimes be. Though delighted with much of Berlioz's music, he found that it often fell far short of any substantial correspondence with the proclaimed program. Tovey, 1937, IV, 74–89. Others, observing the same gap, were not open to these delights. See Shaw, 1981, I, 214 for an amusing dig at the programmatic content in Liszt's *Inferno*.

15. Quoted in Scruton, 1980, 15: 283. Emphasis added. Also quoted in Berg, 1976, 86.

16. MacDonald, Hugh, 1980, "Symphonic poem," in Sadie, 1980, 18: 432.

17. Musical absolutism, which rejects the idea of extrinsic, referential musical meaning for the notion of inherent, purely musical significance, resists subordinate forms and parallelism. This idea has been articulated through different periods and in different contexts; for a classic romantic expression see Hanslick, 1963 and 1986.

18. On the other side are those advocating "invisible" film scores that are only sensed subconsciously.

19. Once again, the reference here is to the use of this concerto in Noel Coward's and David Lean's *Brief Encounter* (1945).

20. Berg, 1976, 84. For a critique of program music and its impulses in film, see Eisler, 1947, x, 13, 35, 57, 103.

21. *Ibid.*, 99. Emphasis added.

22. See Wagner's criticism that Berlioz's compositions are not *musically* rational, because they are appropriate and relevant to *extramusical* imperative. In Newman, 1910, 143.

23. Burch, 1990, 236.

24. London, 1936, 55.

25. George, 1914 (2nd ed.), 15. See Hegel, 1979, 128, for a similar list of absolute music's expressive versatility.

26. Goepf, I, 38, 125. See also discussions throughout on Mendelssohn, some Beethoven (particularly the third, sixth, and ninth symphonies), Berlioz, Liszt, and Richard Strauss. Merits and charms notwithstanding, Goepf always finds that these programmatic symphonies fall short of absolute musical ideals.