

82. Bernstein, 1976, 53. There is a potential problem attached to this notion of art communicating, and Bernstein's implied equation of communication and verbalization. As Goepf suggests, egalitarian communication can become a diminished, even depraved thing. Not all communications, particularly when they are musical, are so easily reduced to the verbal. (i.e., the elusive musical narratives of Wagner, Strauss, Schoenberg, Berg; Scruton's valid concerns about reductive program discussions, and of music's resistance to reductive interpretation.) The mixing of media, the interpretations that accrue to this mixing, are inevitably problematic. For a discussion on this problematic, see my section on "indeterminacy" in chapter five.

83. Edgerton, 1988, 4.

84. Temperley, 1985, 18.

85. Cf. Subotnik, 1976.

86. Newman, 1905, 137–41. Hegel (1920, III 425), speaking of pre-romantic composers, says that although they may have shown a great musical gift at an early age, that otherwise they "remain their lifelong men of the poorest and most impoverished intellectual faculty in other directions." (See also Eisler, 1947, 46–47; also Bazelon, 1975, 20, on similar circumstances of Hollywood composers.) This situation is in marked contrast to Mendelssohn, who globe-trotted and was a friend of the cultured famous, to the voraciously literate Schumann (Abraham, 1985, 101) and the even more broadly cultured Liszt (Searle, 1985, 241). In fact, Liszt also developed a literary reputation, and one of his earliest subjects was the need for the artist to leave his "superior servant" status and be accepted as a respected member of the community. *Ibid.*, 243. It could be said that Eisenstein and Vertov and the general progressive notion of the unalienated revolutionary artist descend directly from this programmatic place.

87. See Newman, 1910, 157–79, for a convincing discussion of program music's progressive potential.

88. For musical and musical dramatic expressions of these aspirations, see Beethoven's 9th Symphony, Wagner's *Die Meistersinger*, or *Parsifal*.