

The picture, which presents the narrative, traces the fluctuations of the workers' struggles, while the music affirms the inevitability of the workers' victory. Here is formal counterpoint, as the image "melody" now departs from, now returns to, its musical counterpart, as Pudovkin's "lines" separate and unite and eventually resolve in a cadence of victory. The *figurative* counterpoint is found in the collision of what some of the images mean, and the music's seeming contradiction to that meaning. Significantly, it is that *collision* that Pudovkin most emphasizes, and in the collision that eventual resolution and intellectual synthesis are accomplished.⁶¹

Pudovkin implies two counterpoints, and presents both alternatives, but his work raises questions as to whether the formal and the figurative are compatible, at least with respect to the early theory. Discussing the music in this sequence from *Deserter*, Kracauer observes that original music does not enact a collision, nor create a concept very effectively. The flow of formal counterpoint undercuts the figurative function, and the audience simply does not understand. "Like sound proper, music is quite able to characterize . . . concepts and notions as are already given us; but it cannot define or symbolize them by itself alone."⁶²

So, as we have seen, musical parallelism underestimates the complexity of meaning in film, and in the world that film reflects. The "contrapuntal" alternative falls short too. But Pudovkin and the Soviets generally theorized and practiced in order to find an alternative to the oversimplifications of parallelism and its social equivalents. As shown by Brecht's somewhat similar work, this impulse was not limited to film circles. As will be shown by the properties of music as they relate to meaning, success in this regard was still possible.

How? By a better, more realistic understanding of the properties of musical meaning. I will now elaborate on Edward Said's idea, introduced in my first chapter, that music can be contextualized through reference and allusion. Concurrent with early silent film practice, there was a movement in linguistics to counter its kind of overwhelming underdetermination. It is now generally related that before the pioneering work of Ferdinand de Saussure, linguistics concentrated on etymology, and that the actual articulations of language were taken for granted as natural. The ac-