

questioned the necessity of this correspondence, in part because it questioned the arbitrary and constraining suppositions that often lay beneath it. Silent music practice is full of these suppositions.

Edith Lang and George West's seminal 1920 primer, *Musical Accompaniment of Motion Pictures*, features the following illustration.

There are certain keys such as A flat and E flat which suggest "warmth" or languor, such as B flat minor or G minor which fit a mood of sorrow and grief, such as A or D major which lend themselves to brilliancy, such as E major which suggests "clear skies" or "the ocean's wide expanse." . . . The key of C has nothing to commend it . . .¹⁶

With similar arbitrariness Lang and West link certain tone colors, or organ stops, to specific meanings: suspicion, clarinet solo with string accompaniment; entreaty, saxophone solo with string 8' and flute 8' accompaniment; temptation, clarinet or oboe with string accompaniment; defiance, reeds *mf*; treachery, reeds *mf*; torture, reeds *f*.¹⁷

It is unclear why all this should be so, beyond maybe convention and our susceptibility to the power of suggestion. Whatever the source, we see here a confidence in inevitable, inherent musical meaning. That confidence in musical matters extended to the films themselves, to their messages, and to the way audiences responded to them.

In the introduction to his influential film music collection *Motion Picture Moods for Pianists and Organists* (1924), Erno Rapée makes the following proposition.

One third of all film footage is used to depict action; another third will show no physical action, but will have, as a preponderance, psychologic situations; the remaining third will neither show action nor suggest psychological situations, but will restrict itself to showing or creating atmosphere or scenery.¹⁸

Throughout this publication Rapée's "moods" and "situations" are consistent with this schematic rendering of film narrative, and are suggestive of music's functioning in the support thereof. These categories—action, psychology, atmosphere—are seen as discrete, inherently separate, nonintersecting. Meaning in