

light opera on the Continent. Clearly he had an investment in, and evidently an affection for, popular musical expression, especially as it related to popular musical forms. It is also possible that as a popular musician/composer, he felt somewhat self-conscious in august Grovian company. Irving is the most dismissive of the three 1954 writers, and his attitude is similar to the sense of pugnacious inferiority often found in film musician discourse. On Irving see Sadie, 1980, 9: 329.

Wilfred Mellers' writing has none of this protesting-too-much, and he is not an academic absolutist. He has always been interested in music's social background, as evidenced by his first book, *Music and Society* (1946). His 1965 work, *Harmonious Meeting*, sympathetically investigated the relationship between music, poetry, and drama in the English baroque, and the music degree course he started at York University in 1964 pioneered the application of extramusical factors (social and historical determinants) to musical study. His book *The Twilight of the Gods* (1973) is a delightful musicological analysis and fan letter to the Beatles and their at once (unconsciously) sophisticated and fully accessible music. His editing of the series "Music and Society," (see Russell, 1987) bespeaks his continued interest in and commitment to the study of music in its context. I will return to Mellers later (see also Sadie, 1980, 12: 108–10).

52. Keller, 1951 (*Music Review*, XII), 324.

53. Keller, 1950 (*Music Review*, XI), 145.

54. Keller, 1949 (*Music Review*, X), 50–51.

55. I.e., Rudolf Arnheim and Erwin Panofsky. Both critics are in some ways sympathetic to film, but their tone can also be condescending. Arnheim, 1957; Panofsky, 1934, "Style and Medium in the Motion Pictures," in Mast, Cohen, and Braudy, 1985, 233–48.

56. Keller, 1956 (*Music Review*, XVII), 255.

57. Keller, 1948 (*Music Review*, IX), 197.

58. Keller, 1951 (*Music Review*, XII), 315.

59. Keller, 1949 (*Music Review*, X), 225.

60. Keller, 1951 (*Music Review*, XII), 223. See also Adorno on arrangement (1991, 36).

61. Keller, 1953 (*Music Review*, XIV), 311–12.

62. Keller, 1949, 25, 26. See Keller (1946, 136) on the related evils of pastiche.

63. Keller, 1951 (*Music Review*, XII), 147–49.

64. Keller, 1953, (*Music Review*, XIV), 311–12.

65. Keller, 1952 (*Music Review*, XIII), see 209–11. As with many other issues here considered, the desirability and difficulty of such compromise is not unique to film. Franz Liszt discussed the challenge posed