

music cultural spokesman such consistent film music haters? As we will see, the situation is not so easily reduced; elitism is only part of a complex cluster of attitudes and motivations behind musical suspicion of film. As such, it is obviously important to respond to the biases of the 1954 edition not as absolute expressions to adopt or reject, as for instance film composers and their defenders have been wont to do, but as statements inflected by setting and context.⁵⁰

Sentiments expressed in the Grove dictionaries are not necessarily untrue: music has, historically, been subservient, and it has often been substandard. Romanticism in film music and clear-eyed observation as well may imply the effacement of individual expression within repressive capitalist economies. But it is also highly romantic and inaccurate to suggest that effacement eliminates meaning or its expression. Subconscious signification is signification nevertheless. The fact remains that what is mediocre in evaluative economies—the predominant reduction of films to either good or bad status—should still be subject to consideration that is more than just dismissive.

FILM MUSIC CRITICISM: UNDERLYING SENTIMENTS

Similarly, these same critical evaluations should be interrogated, as validations and condemnations both are illuminated by the conditions and ideologies that gave them rise. We will now look more closely at music community dismissals of film music, and particularly of the use in films of the classics. There are various voices and motivations, all opening up larger issues than we might at first see.

One of the writers of the 1954 *Grove's* film music entry, Hans Keller, criticized film music for *Music Review* from 1948 to 1959.⁵¹ The apparent hostility found in Keller's *Grove's* entry can also be found in his *Music Review* writing. "That Hollywood music in and beyond Hollywood is the most powerful force unmusicality has ever commanded must be a truism to every musical mind."⁵² He is skeptical about and often dismissive of original film composition, and these attitudes are a result of a great and demanding musicological sophistication.