

proaches to film music. He posits three receptive categories. Causal listening seeks the source of sound, and its specific meaning. Semantic listening, which is based on codes and language, contains the possible extravagances (personal interpretations) of the causal alternative. And reduced listening, like formalism, seeks only to observe and account without recourse to interpretation or semiotic rationalization.⁵⁹

Which approach is validated? All of them. Chion rejects methodological hierarchies, and compositional ones as well. He too effaces distinctions between diegetic and nondiegetic music, between original compositions and excerpted ones. Each option means, and each deserves attention; I agree. There are numerous points to consider when studying classical music in film. Few of them have received any substantial attention. Rather than following previous courses of prescription and proscription, I will present a broad survey of approaches. It will be left for the reader to choose and follow what he or she feels to be the most productive path.

NOTES

1. Kerman, 1985, 12.
2. Ibid, 18.
3. Ibid, 31–59, 79–90.
4. See Tovey, 1937, Meyer, 1956, Cooke, 1959. For criticism see Monelle, 1992, 1–30.
5. Kerman, 1985, 107.
6. Ibid., 108. The phrase “emotion and meaning” refers to the title of Meyer’s 1956 book, *Emotion and Meaning in Music*.
7. Said, 1991, xiv–xvi. Elaboration is by no means a new concept. Donald Tovey’s musical criticism contains many striking extrapolations from extramusical discourse. See for instance his comments on the relations between Mendelssohn’s incidental music to *A Midsummernight’s Dream* and Shakespeare’s play. Tovey, 1937, IV, 102–9.
8. Sandall, 1994, 19.
9. Gill, 1994, 3.
10. This idea was first and most influentially stated in London, 1936, 37.
11. The title of Claudia Gorbman’s *Unheard Melodies: Narrative*